

To Chairperson of the
Tender Committee

M.S. Grishanin

Written opinion of the Tender
Committee member I.I. Klebanov
on issues in the agenda of a
Transneft Tender Committee meeting
scheduled for 23 March 2017

Since I cannot be present at the meeting to be held on 23 March 2017 for review and assessment of applications for participation in the open tender for selecting an auditor to perform mandatory annual audit of Transneft for 2017 and review the interim consolidated financial statements by IFRS for the 1st quarter of 2018, I am hereby giving my written opinion and ask you to take it into account in voting on the following issues in the agenda of the Tender Committee:

1. Review and assessment of applications for participation in the open tender for selecting an auditor to perform mandatory annual audit of Transneft for 2017 and review the interim consolidated financial statements by IFRS for the 1st quarter of 2018.
2. Naming the winner of the tender for selecting an auditor to perform mandatory annual audit of Transneft for 2017 and review the interim consolidated financial statements by IFRS for the 1st quarter of 2018.

I.I. Klebanov

##	Components of the assessment criterion “Skills of the open tender participants, including experience related to the subject of the contract, and business reputation, specialists and other employees with a certain level of skills”	KPMG	BDO Unicon	Deloitte & Touche CIS
1.	General approach of an auditor to the audit	34	6	30
1.1.	Audit works plan and man-hours	3	1	3
1.2.	Presentation of the deliverables	2	1	2
1.3.	Methodological basis for auditing fuel and energy companies and natural monopolies	29	4	25
2.	General and professional characteristic of the auditor	19	7	20
2.1.	Membership in international auditor associations	3	1	3
2.2.	Passing the external control of the auditor work quality	2	2	2
2.3.	Information about the ratings adjudged to the auditor	14	4	15
3.	The level of skills, education, and experience possessed by the auditor’s specialists proposed for participation in the audit	30	6	26
3.1.	The level of skills, education, and experience possessed by executives	12	2	11
3.2.	The level of skills, education, and experience possessed by engaged specialists	12	2	9
3.3.	General characteristic of an audit firm’s group	5	1	5
3.4.	General impression of CVs presented	1	1	1
4.	Additional information	15	4	15
4.1.	List of main clients	12	3	12
4.2.	Other information submitted by an auditor	3	1	3
	TOTAL	98	23	91
	Rating	100.00	23.47	92.86
	Rating with regard for the criterion weight (70%)	70.00	16.43	65.00

Tender Committee member

I.I. Klebanov

I suggest:

1. To recognize the open tender for selecting an auditor to perform mandatory annual audit of Transneft for 2017 and review the interim consolidated financial statements by IFRS for the 1st quarter of 2018 as successful (transpired).

2. Based on the review results and assessment of applications submitted by the tender participants, to assign number one to the application of the following tender participant:

- KPMG

Mail address: Naberezhnaya Tower, block C, 10 Presnenskaya embankment, Moscow, the Russian Federation, 123112.

3. Based on the review results and assessment of applications submitted by the tender participants, to assign number two to the application of the following tender participant:

- Deloitte & Touche CIS

Mail address: 5 B Lesnaya st., Moscow, Russia, 125047.

4. To recognize KPMG which bid the best terms of contract performance, based on the criteria indicated in the tender documentation and application for participation in the open tender, and was assigned the first number, as the winner of the open tender for selecting an auditor to perform mandatory annual audit of Transneft for 2017 and review the interim consolidated financial statements by IFRS for the 1st quarter of 2018.

5. To publish the protocol of review and assessment of applications for participation in the open tender for selecting an auditor for mandatory annual audit of Transneft for 2017 and review the interim consolidated financial statements by IFRS for the 1st quarter of 2018 in the integrated information system (www.zakupki.gov.ru) and on the website of Transneft (www.transneft.ru).

Signature of the Tender Committee member:

Committee member:

I.I. Klebanov